Persistence, permanence, and global stability in reaction network models: some results inspired by thermodynamic principles

> Gheorghe Craciun Department of Mathematics and Department of Biomolecular Chemistry University of Wisconsin-Madison



Hanahan and Weinberg, The Hallmarks of Cancer, Cell, 2000.

Metabolic Pathways	

Roche Applied Science









$$f(v) = 4\pi \left(\frac{m}{2\pi kT}\right)^{3/2} v^2 e^{-mv^2/(2kT)}$$





In other words: the Maxwell distribution is a global attractor.



Boltzmann used a key hypothesis:



"detailed balance"

i.e. the forward and backward transition rates (at equilibrium) balance each other out:



 $X_1 \to X_2$

$$X_1 \to X_2$$

$$\frac{dx_1}{dt} = -kx_1$$
$$\frac{dx_1}{dt} = kx_1$$

$X_1 + X_2 \to X_3$

$$X_1 + X_2 \to X_3$$

$$\frac{dx_1}{dt} = -kx_1x_2$$
$$\frac{dx_2}{dt} = -kx_1x_2$$
$$\frac{dx_3}{dt} = kx_1x_2$$

$$X_1 + X_2 \to X_3 + X_4$$

$\frac{dx_1}{dt}$	—	$-kx_1x_2$
$\frac{dx_2}{dt}$	—	$-kx_1x_2$
$\frac{dx_3}{dt}$	—	kx_1x_2
$\frac{dx_4}{dt}$	—	kx_1x_2

$X_1 + X_2 \rightleftharpoons X_3 + X_4$

$X_1 + X_2 \rightleftharpoons X_3 + X_4$

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{dx_1}{dt} &= -k_1 x_1 x_2 + k_2 x_3 x_4 \\ \frac{dx_2}{dt} &= -k_1 x_1 x_2 + k_2 x_3 x_4 \\ \frac{dx_3}{dt} &= k_1 x_1 x_2 - k_2 x_3 x_4 \\ \frac{dx_4}{dt} &= k_1 x_1 x_2 - k_2 x_3 x_4 \end{aligned}$$

 $\varnothing \xrightarrow{k_1} X_1 \xrightarrow{k_2} X_1 + X_2 \xrightarrow{k_3} \varnothing$

 $\varnothing \xrightarrow{k_1} X_1 \xrightarrow{k_2} X_1 + X_2 \xrightarrow{k_3} \varnothing$

 $\frac{dx_1}{dt}$ $= k_1 - k_3 x_1 x_2$ dx_2 $= k_2 x_1 - k_3 x_1 x_2$ dt

Chemical reaction networks and polynomial dynamical systems



$$\varnothing \xrightarrow{0.7} X_1 \xrightarrow{1} X_1 + X_2 \xrightarrow{1} \varnothing$$

Chemical reaction networks and polynomial dynamical systems



Chemical reaction networks and polynomial dynamical systems



But, many polynomial systems have very stable dynamics:

Global Attractor Conjecture: complex balanced systems are globally stable (Horn, 1974).





Why? By analogy to Boltzmann's H-theorem.

$$2A_1 = A_1 + A_2 = 2A_2$$

$$\frac{dx_1}{dt} = -k_1 x_1^2 + k_2 x_1 x_2 - k_3 x_1 x_2 + k_4 x_2^2 - 2k_5 x_1^2 + 2k_6 x_2^2$$
$$\frac{dx_2}{dt} = k_1 x_1^2 - k_2 x_1 x_2 + k_3 x_1 x_2 - k_4 x_2^2 + 2k_5 x_1^2 - 2k_6 x_2^2$$

$$2A_1 = A_1 + A_2 = 2A_2$$

$$\frac{dx_1}{dt} = -k_1 x_1^2 + k_2 x_1 x_2 - k_3 x_1 x_2 + k_4 x_2^2 - 2k_5 x_1^2 + 2k_6 x_2^2$$
$$\frac{dx_2}{dt} = k_1 x_1^2 - k_2 x_1 x_2 + k_3 x_1 x_2 - k_4 x_2^2 + 2k_5 x_1^2 - 2k_6 x_2^2$$

$$\frac{d}{dt} \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \end{bmatrix} = k_1 x_1^2 \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + k_2 x_1 x_2 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} + k_3 x_1 x_2 \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \\ + k_4 x_2^2 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} + k_5 x_1^2 \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} + k_6 x_2^2 \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$2A_1 = A_1 + A_2 = 2A_2$$

$$\frac{d}{dt} \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \end{bmatrix} = k_1 x_1^2 \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + k_2 x_1 x_2 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} + k_3 x_1 x_2 \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \\ + k_4 x_2^2 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} + k_5 x_1^2 \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} + k_6 x_2^2 \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$2A_1 = A_1 + A_2 = 2A_2$$

$$\frac{d}{dt} \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \end{bmatrix} = k_1 x_1^2 \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + k_2 x_1 x_2 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} + k_3 x_1 x_2 \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \\ + k_4 x_2^2 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} + k_5 x_1^2 \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} + k_6 x_2^2 \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} k_i x^{y_i} (y'_i - y_i)$$

Mass-action kinetics $2A_1 \rightleftharpoons A_1 + A_2 \rightleftharpoons 2A_2$ $\frac{d}{dt} \begin{vmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \end{vmatrix} = k_1 x_1^2 \begin{vmatrix} -1 \\ 1 \end{vmatrix} + k_2 x_1 x_2 \begin{vmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{vmatrix} + k_3 x_1 x_2 \begin{vmatrix} -1 \\ 1 \end{vmatrix}$ $+k_4x_2^2\begin{bmatrix}1\\-1\end{bmatrix}+k_5x_1^2\begin{bmatrix}-2\\2\end{bmatrix}+k_6x_2^2\begin{bmatrix}2\\-2\end{bmatrix}$ $\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} k_i x^{y_i} (y'_i - y_i)$ *y*₃





ndx $= \sum k_i x^{y_i} (y'_i - y_i)$ dti=1

ndx $(k_i x^{y_i} (y'_i - y_i))$ dti=1

Any polynomial dynamical system can be represented by an "Euclidean embedded graph"



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} k_i x^{y_i} (y'_i - y_i)$$

Any polynomial dynamical system can be represented by an "Euclidean embedded graph"



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} k_i x^{y_i} (y'_i - y_i)$$

Any polynomial dynamical system can be represented by an "Euclidean embedded graph"



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

Complex balance condition:

 $k_{\bar{y} \to y} x_0^y$

$$\sum_{y \to \bar{y} \in G} k_{y \to \bar{y}} x_0^y = \sum_{\bar{y} \to y \in G}$$

$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} k_i x^{y_i} (y'_i - y_i)$$

Any polynomial dynamical system can be represented by an "Euclidean embedded graph"



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

Complex balance condition:

$$\sum_{y \to \bar{y} \in G} k_{y \to \bar{y}} x_0^y = \sum_{\bar{y} \to y \in G} k_{\bar{y} \to y} x_0^{\bar{y}}$$

Remark: complex balance implies that the graph is "weakly reversible"

$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} k_i x^{y_i} (y'_i - y_i)$$

Any polynomial dynamical system can be represented by an "Euclidean embedded graph"



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

Complex balance condition:

$$\sum_{y \to \bar{y} \in G} k_{y \to \bar{y}} x_0^y = \sum_{\bar{y} \to y \in G} k_{\bar{y} \to y} x_0^{\bar{y}}$$

Remark: complex balance implies that the graph is "weakly reversible"



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

$$\sum_{y \to \bar{y} \in G} k_{y \to \bar{y}} x_0^y = \sum_{\bar{y} \to y \in G} k_{\bar{y} \to y} x_0^{\bar{y}}$$



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

$$\sum_{y \to \bar{y} \in G} k_{y \to \bar{y}} x_0^y = \sum_{\bar{y} \to y \in G} k_{\bar{y} \to y} x_0^{\bar{y}}$$



$$L(\mathbf{x}) = \sum_{j=1}^{n} x_i (\ln x_i - \ln x_i^* - 1)$$

Theorem. If a reaction system is complex balanced then there exists a strict Lyapunov function within each linear invariant subspace.

$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

$$\sum_{y \to \bar{y} \in G} k_{y \to \bar{y}} x_0^y = \sum_{\bar{y} \to y \in G} k_{\bar{y} \to y} x_0^{\bar{y}}$$

Conjecture (Horn 1974). If a system is complex balanced then it has a globally attracting point within each linear invariant subspace.

Conjecture (Horn 1974). If a system is complex balanced then it has a globally attracting point within each linear invariant subspace.

Conjecture (Horn 1974). If a system is complex balanced then it has a globally attracting point within each linear invariant subspace.



$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

$$\sum_{y \to \bar{y} \in G} k_{y \to \bar{y}} x_0^y = \sum_{\bar{y} \to y \in G} k_{\bar{y} \to y} x_0^{\bar{y}}$$

Conjecture (Horn 1974). If a system is complex balanced then it has a globally attracting point within each linear invariant subspace.



Remark 1: if the graph G is weakly reversible and embedding is in "general position" then the system is guaranteed to be complex balanced (by the deficiency zero theorem).

Conjecture (Horn 1974). If a system is complex balanced then it has a globally attracting point within each linear invariant subspace.



Remark 1: if the graph G is weakly reversible and embedding is in "general position" then the system is guaranteed to be complex balanced (by the deficiency zero theorem).

Remark 2: The "Extended Permanence Conjecture" says that if the graph G is weakly reversible then the system is variable-k permanent.

Timeline

Timeline

1876: *Boltzmann, entropy, the H-theorem* 1901: Wegscheider, the Wegscheider paradox

1930: Onsager, the reciprocal relations

1962: Wei and Prater, linear systems, global strict Lyapunov function

1967: Shear, reversible systems with unique steady state, global strict Lyapunov function

1968: Higgins, points out Shear's error

1972: Horn and Jackson, complex balanced systems, global strict Lyapunov function

1972: Horn and Feinberg, deficiency zero theorem

1972: *Kurtz*, connection between stochastic and deterministic mass-action kinetics

1974: Horn, the Global Attractor Conjecture

Global Attractor Conjecture: towards an "algebraic thermodynamics"

1972: Horn and Jackson, complex balanced systems, global strict Lyapunov function

1972: Horn and Feinberg, deficiency zero theorem

1990s, early 2000s: Siegel, Sontag, boundary equilibria, global stability

2007: Craciun, Dickenstein, Shiu, Sturmfels, proof of special case of 2D global attractor conjecture

2009: Anderson and Shiu, proof of 2D global attractor conjecture

2010: Craciun, Nazarov, Pantea, introduce permanence conjecture, proof of 3D global attractor conjecture

2011: Anderson, proof of global attractor conjecture for single linkage class

2013: Gopalkrishnan, Miller, Shiu, proof of global attractor conjecture for strongly endotactic networks

$$\varnothing \rightleftharpoons X_1 \rightleftharpoons X_2 \rightleftharpoons \varnothing$$
$$2X_1 + X_2 \rightleftharpoons 3X_1$$

Complex balanced dynamical systems

Deficiency zero weakly reversible reaction systems

Complex balanced dynamical systems

Weakly reversible reaction systems

Deficiency zero weakly reversible reaction systems

Complex balanced dynamical systems

Deficiency zero weakly reversible reaction systems Weakly reversible reaction systems

Endotactic systems

Toric differential inclusions

Endotactic

systems

Complex balanced dynamical systems

Deficiency zero weakly reversible reaction systems Weakly reversible reaction systems

Question: what remains from global stability if we add external signals?

Toric differential inclusions

Endotactic

systems

Complex balanced dynamical systems

Deficiency zero weakly reversible reaction systems

Weakly reversible reaction systems

Question: what remains from global stability if we add external signals?

Toric differential inclusions

Endotactic

systems

Complex balanced dynamical systems

Deficiency zero weakly reversible reaction systems

Weakly reversible reaction systems

Possible answer: homeostasis

$$\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y' \in G} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$$

 $\frac{dx}{dt} = \sum_{y \to y'} k_{y \to y'} x^y (y' - y)$ $y {\rightarrow} y' {\in} G$

dx $\sum k_{y \to y'}(t) x^y (y' - y)$ $\frac{dt}{dt} =$ $y {\rightarrow} y' {\in} G$

 $\frac{dx}{dt}$ $\sum k_{y \to y'}(t) x^y (y' - y)$ = $y \rightarrow y' \in G$

 $\frac{dx}{dt}$ $\sum k_{y \to y'}(t) x^y (y' - y)$ = $y \rightarrow y' \in G$

Robustly permanent system

Question: what remains from global stability if we add external signals?

Toric differential inclusions

Endotactic

systems

Complex balanced dynamical systems

Deficiency zero weakly reversible reaction systems

Weakly reversible reaction systems

Possible answer: homeostasis

Metabolic Pathways	

Roche Applied Science

F. Horn, R. Jackson, General mass action kinetics, Archive for Rational Mechanics and Analysis, 1972.

G. Craciun, Polynomial Dynamical Systems, Reaction Networks, and Toric Differential Inclusions, SIAM J. Appl. Algebra Geometry, 2019.

G. Craciun, Toric differential inclusions and a proof of the Global Attractor Conjecture, on ArXiv.

D. Anderson, G. Craciun, T. Kurtz, Product-form stationary distributions for deficiency zero chemical reaction networks, Bulletin of Mathematical Biology, 2010.

G. Craciun, A. Dickenstein, A. Shiu, B. Sturmfels, Toric Dynamical Systems, J. Symb. Comp. 2009.

G. Craciun, F. Nazarov, C. Pantea, Persistence and permanence of mass-action and power-law dynamical systems, SIAM J. Appl. Math. 2013.

References

D. Angeli, P. de Leenheer, and E.D. Sontag. Persistence results for chemical reaction networks with time-dependent kinetics and no global conservation laws. SIAM J. Appl. Math. 2011.

D. Anderson, A proof of the Global Attractor Conjecture in the single linkage class case, SIAM J. Appl. Math. 2011.

M. Gopalkrishnan, E. Miller, A. Shiu, A geometric approach to the Global Attractor Conjecture, SIAM J. Appl. Dyn. Syst. 2014.

B. Boros and J. Hofbauer, Permanence of weakly reversible mass-action systems with a single linkage class, available on ArXiv.

L. Desvillettes, K. Fellner, B.Q. Tang, Trend to equilibrium for Reaction-Diffusion system arising from Complex Balanced Chemical Reaction Networks, SIAM J. Appl. Math. 2017.

G. Craciun, J. Jin, C. Pantea, A. Tudorascu, Convergence to the complex balanced equilibrium for some chemical reaction-diffusion systems with boundary equilibria, available on ArXiv.